

Division of Surface Water

Total Maximum Daily Loads for the Big Darby Creek Watershed



Little Darby Creek at its confluence with Big Darby Creek

**Final Report
January 6, 2006**

Bob Taft, Governor
Joseph P. Koncelik, Director

Table of Contents

Guide to Tables, Figures, and Other Visuals	iv
Acknowledgments	xii
1.0 Introduction	1-1
1.1 The Clean Water Act Requirement to Address Impaired Waters	1-1
1.2 Public Involvement	1-2
1.3 Organization of This Report	1-3
1.4 Water Quality Standards	1-3
1.4.1 Aquatic Life Uses	1-7
1.4.2 Non-aquatic Life Uses	1-8
1.4.3 Proposed Water Quality Standards Changes	1-8
1.4.4 Use Attainment Status	1-9
2.0 Watershed Overview and Assessment	2-1
2.1 Chapter Organization	2-1
2.2 Upper Big Darby Creek	2-9
2.2.1 Headwaters of Big Darby Creek (190-010)	2-12
2.2.2 Flat Branch (190-020)	2-14
2.2.3 Big Darby Creek below Flat Branch to Milford Center (190-030) ..	2-18
2.2.4 Big Darby Creek below Milford Center to Sugar Run (190-040) ..	2-22
2.2.5 Buck Run (190-050)	2-25
2.2.6 Robinson Run (190-060)	2-28
2.2.7 Sugar Run (190-070)	2-30
2.3 Middle Big Darby Creek	2-33
2.3.1 Upper Middle Big Darby Creek (200-010)	2-35
2.3.2 Lower Middle Big Darby Creek (200-020)	2-39
2.4 Little Darby Creek	2-42
2.4.1 Upper Little Darby Creek (210-010)	2-44
2.4.2 Upper Treacle Creek (210-020)	2-47
2.4.3 Proctor Run (210-030)	2-49
2.4.4 Lower Treacle Creek (210-040)	2-52
2.4.5 Middle Little Darby Creek (210-050)	2-54
2.4.6 Spring Fork (210-060)	2-58
2.4.7 Lower Little Darby Creek (210-070)	2-61
2.5 Lower Big Darby Creek	2-64
2.5.1 Hellbranch Run (220-010)	2-66
2.5.2 Big Darby Creek below LDC to Hellbranch Run (220-020)	2-70
2.5.3 Big Darby Creek below Hellbranch Run to Darbyville (220-030) ..	2-73
2.5.4 Big Darby Creek below Darbyville to the Scioto River (220-040) ..	2-77

3.0	Description of Watershed Analysis	3-1
3.1	Linking the Biological Assessment, Watershed Characteristics, and In-stream Criteria: A Roadmap to Navigate How to Get from Impairment to Attainment	3-2
3.2	Target Conditions	3-3
3.2.1	Load Based Pollutants and In-stream Conditions	3-3
3.2.2	Flow Quantity and Changes in Hydrology	3-7
3.2.3	Geomorphology of the Channel	3-8
3.2.4	Habitat and Bedload Quality	3-10
3.2.5	Protecting the Downstream Use	3-11
3.3	Summary of Methods	3-11
3.3.1	Hydrologic Response	3-11
3.3.2	Loads to the Stream	3-14
3.3.2.1	Total Phosphorus and Sediment	3-14
3.3.2.2	Bacteria and Pathogens	3-18
3.3.3	Response in the Stream	3-20
3.3.4	Flood Plain	3-23
3.3.5	Habitat Quality and Bedload	3-24
3.4	Critical Conditions and Seasonality	3-27
3.5	Margin of Safety	3-28
4.0	Watershed Analysis, Loading Capacity, and Allocations	4-1
4.1	Upper Big Darby Creek	4-3
4.1.1	Big Darby Creek: Headwaters to Above Flat Branch	4-14
4.1.2	Flat Branch	4-16
4.1.3	Big Darby Creek: Below Flat Branch to Milford Center	4-18
4.1.4	Big Darby Creek: Milford Center to Sugar Run	4-20
4.1.5	Buck Run	4-22
4.1.6	Robinson Run	4-24
4.1.7	Sugar Run	4-26
4.1.8	Chemical Associations in the Upper Big Darby Creek Sub-Watershed	4-29
4.2	Middle Big Darby Creek	4-34
4.2.1	Big Darby Creek from Sugar Run to High Free Pike	4-38
4.2.2	Big Darby Creek from High Free Pike to Little Darby Creek	4-40
4.3	Little Darby Creek	4-42
4.3.1	Upper Little Darby Creek headwaters to Treacle Creek	4-50
4.3.2	Upper Treacle Creek	4-52
4.3.3	Proctor Run	4-53
4.3.4	Lower Treacle Creek	4-55
4.3.5	Middle Little Darby Creek: Treacle Creek to Spring Fork	4-56
4.3.6	Spring Fork	4-58
4.3.7	Lower Little Darby Creek, Spring Fork to Big Darby Creek	4-60

4.4	Lower Big Darby Creek	4-63
4.4.1	Hellbranch Run	4-71
4.4.2	Upper Lower Big Darby Creek	4-76
4.4.3	Middle Lower Big Darby Creek	4-77
4.4	Floodplains of the Big Darby Creek Watershed	4-80
5.0	Implementation of the Big Darby Creek TMDL	5-1
5.1	Implementation Mechanisms	5-1
5.1.1	Storm Water Control	5-1
5.1.2	Point Source Discharge Control	5-2
5.1.3	Animal Feeding Operations	5-3
5.1.4	Managing Drainage Needs, Channel Erosion, and Flood Reduction Work	5-3
5.1.5	Agricultural BMPs and Programs	5-7
5.1.5.1	Scioto River Watershed Conservation Reserve Enhancement Program (CREP)	5-8
5.1.5.2	Environmental Quality Incentives Program (EQIP)	5-9
5.1.5.3	Section 319 Nonpoint Source Grants	5-9
5.1.5.4	Ohio Water Pollution Control Loan Fund (WPCLF)	5-10
5.1.6	Local Authorities	5-13
5.1.7	208 Plans	5-13
5.2	Sectors of Society and the Big Darby Creek TMDL Recommendations	5-15
5.2.1	Agriculture	5-15
5.2.2	Construction Activity	5-15
5.2.3	Development	5-16
5.2.4	Industrial Activity	5-16
5.2.5	Municipal Point Sources	5-16
5.2.6	Private Point Sources	5-17
5.3	Endangered Species Protection	5-18
5.4	Stream Setbacks and Water Quality	5-19
5.5	Dam Removal	5-21
5.6	Mineral Extraction in the Stream Setback	5-21
5.7	Implementation Strategy and Reasonable Assurances	5-21
	References	R-1
	Appendix A Surface Water and Ground Water Interaction in the Darby	A-1
	Appendix B Responses to Public Comments on the Draft TMDL	B-1

Guide to Tables, Figures, and Other Visuals

Introduction

Table 1.1 Summary of the TMDL process 1-3
Table 1.2 Summary of Ohio Water Quality Standards 1-9

Watershed Overview and Assessment

Figure 2.1.1 Sub-watersheds of the Big Darby Creek watershed 2-3
Table 2.1 Description of hydrologic units in the Big Darby Creek watershed 2-4
Figure 2.1.2 Land use in the Big Darby Creek watershed 2-6
Figure 2.1.3 Schematic representation of upper Big Darby Creek 2-7
Figure 2.1.4 Schematic representation of lower Big Darby Creek and
Little Darby Creek 2-8

Upper Big Darby Creek (05060001 190)

Figure 2.2.1 Aquatic life use attainment in the upper Big Darby Creek 2-10
Figure 2.2.2 Riparian corridor status in the upper Big Darby Creek 2-11

Headwaters of Big Darby Creek (05060001 190 010) 2-12

Box 2.2.1 Overview

Figure 2.2.1.1 Land use
Table 2.2.1 Habitat assessment results

Flat Branch (05060001 190 020) 2-14

Box 2.2.2 Overview

Figure 2.2.2.1 Land use
Figure 2.2.2.2 Confluence of Big Darby Creek with Flat Branch (photo)
Table 2.2.2 Habitat assessment results

Big Darby Creek Below Flat Branch to Milford Center (05060001 190 030) . . . 2-18

Box 2.2.3 Overview

Table 2.2.3 Habitat assessment results
Figure 2.2.3.1 Land use

Big Darby Creek Below Milford Center to Sugar Run (05060001 190 040) 2-22

Box 2.2.4 Overview

Figure 2.2.4.1 Land use
Figure 2.2.4.2 A storm water pool at Select Sires in Unionville Center (photo)
Table 2.2.4 Habitat assessment results

Buck Run (05060001 190 050) 2-25
Box 2.2.5 Overview
Figure 2.2.5.1 Land use
Table 2.2.5 Habitat assessment results

Robinson Run (05060001 190 060) 2-28
Box 2.2.6 Overview
Figure 2.2.6.1 Land use
Table 2.2.6 Habitat assessment results

Sugar Run (05060001 190 070) 2-30
Box 2.2.7 Overview
Figure 2.2.7.1 Land use
Table 2.2.7 Habitat assessment results

Middle Big Darby Creek (05060001 200)
Figure 2.3.1 Aquatic life use attainment 2-33
Figure 2.3.2 Riparian corridor status 2-34

Upper Middle Big Darby Creek (05060001 200 010) 2-35
Box 2.3.1 Overview
Figure 2.3.1.1 Land use
Table 2.3.1 Habitat assessment results

Lower Middle Big Darby Creek (05060001 200 020) 2-39
Box 2.3.2 Overview
Figure 2.3.2.1 Land use
Table 2.3.2 Habitat assessment results

Little Darby Creek (05060001 210)
Figure 2.4.1 Aquatic life use attainment in the upper Big Darby Creek 2-42
Figure 2.4.2 Riparian corridor status in the upper Big Darby Creek 2-43

Upper Little Darby Creek (05060001 210 010) 2-44
Box 2.4.1 Overview
Figure 2.4.1.1 Land use
Table 2.4.1 Habitat assessment results

Upper Treacle Creek (05060001 210 020) 2-47
Box 2.4.2 Overview
Figure 2.4.2.1 Land use
Table 2.4.2 Habitat assessment results

Proctor Run (05060001 210 030) 2-49
Box 2.4.3 Overview
Figure 2.4.3.1 Land use
Table 2.4.3 Habitat assessment results

Lower Treacle Creek (05060001 210 040) 2-52
Box 2.4.4 Overview
Figure 2.4.4.1 Land use
Figure 2.4.4.2 Unrestricted livestock access to lower Treacle Creek (photo)
Table 2.4.4 Habitat assessment results

Middle Little Darby Creek (05060001 210 050) 2-54
Box 2.4.5 Overview
Figure 2.4.5.1 Land use
Table 2.4.5 Habitat assessment results

Spring Fork (05060001 210 060) 2-58
Box 2.4.6 Overview
Figure 2.4.6.1 Land use
Table 2.4.6 Habitat assessment results

Lower Little Darby Creek (05060001 210 070) 2-61
Box 2.4.7 Overview
Figure 2.4.7.1 Land use
Table 2.4.7 Habitat assessment results

Lower Big Darby Creek (05060001 220)
Figure 2.5.1 Aquatic life use attainment 2-64
Figure 2.5.2 Riparian corridor status 2-65

Hellbranch Run (05060001 220 010) 2-66
Box 2.5.1 Overview
Figure 2.5.1.1 Land use
Table 2.5.1 Habitat assessment results

Upper Lower Big Darby Creek (05060001 220 020) 2-70
Box 2.5.2 Overview
Figure 2.5.2.1 Land use
Table 2.5.2 Habitat assessment results

Middle Lower Big Darby Creek (05060001 220 030) 2-73
Box 2.5.3 Overview
Figure 2.5.3.1 Land use
Table 2.5.3 Habitat assessment results

Lower Lower Big Darby Creek (05060001 220 040) 2-77
Box 2.5.3 Overview
Figure 2.5.3.1 Land use
Table 2.5.3 Habitat assessment results

Description of Watershed Analysis

Figure 3.1 Flow diagram of the major stream integrity components 3-2
Table 3.1 TP and TSS targets for the Big Darby Creek watershed 3-5
Table 3.2 Dissolved oxygen criteria 3-6
Figure 3.2 The hydrologic cycle 3-7
Table 3.3 Habitat and bedload TMDL targets 3-10
Figure 3.3 The components of the hydrologic cycle calculated by GWLF 3-12
Table 3.4 Comparison of GWLF predicted streamflow with USGS
streamflow values 3-14
Figure 3.4 Known aerators by township in the Big Darby Creek watershed 3-17
Table 3.5 Summary of the methods used to evaluate loads to the stream 3-20
Figure 3.5 QUAL2E constituent interactions and the basis for the
QUAL2K major interactions 3-22
Table 3.6 Details of habitat and bedload TMDLs 3-26
Table 3.7 Summary of methods to evaluate instream responses
and habitat 3-27

Watershed Analysis, Loading Capacity and Allocations

Upper Big Darby Creek (05060001 190)

Table 4.1.1 Bedload and habitat TMDLs 4-5
Table 4.1.2 Recommended flood plain widths 4-9
Table 4.1.3 Comparison of needed and predicted active floodplain for
selected segments in the Big Darby Creek 4-10
Figure 4.1.1 Comparison of recommended and predicted active floodplain
of Flat Branch with Big Darby Creek 4-12
Figure 4.1.2 Comparison of recommended and predicted active floodplain
of Buck Run with Big Darby Creek 4-13

Headwaters of Big Darby Creek (05060001 190 010) 4-14

Table 4.1.1.1 Allocations of phosphorus, sediment, and fecal coliform
Table 4.1.1.2 Point source allocations
Table 4.1.1.3 Total phosphorus relative source contributions

<i>Flat Branch (05060001 190 020)</i>	4-16
Table 4.1.2.1 Allocations of phosphorus, sediment, and fecal coliform	
Table 4.1.2.2 Point source allocations	
Table 4.1.2.3 Total phosphorus relative source contributions	
Figure 4.1.2 Longitudinal distribution of recommended versus predicted flood plain width, IBI, and aquatic life use attainment status	
<i>Big Darby Creek Below Flat Branch to Milford Center (05060001 190 030)</i> . . .	4-18
Table 4.1.3.1 Allocations of phosphorus, sediment, and fecal coliform	
Table 4.1.3.2 Point source allocations	
Table 4.1.3.3 Total phosphorus relative source contributions	
Figure 4.1.3 Longitudinal distribution of recommended versus predicted flood plain width, IBI, and aquatic life use attainment status	
<i>Big Darby Creek Below Milford Center to Sugar Run (05060001 190 040)</i>	4-20
Table 4.1.4.1 Allocations of phosphorus and sediment	
Table 4.1.4.2 Point source allocations	
Table 4.1.4.3 Total phosphorus relative source contributions	
<i>Buck Run (05060001 190 050)</i>	4-22
Table 4.1.5.1 Allocations of phosphorus, sediment, and fecal coliform	
Table 4.1.5.2 Point source allocations	
Table 4.1.5.3 Total phosphorus relative source contributions	
Figure 4.1.5 Longitudinal distribution of recommended versus predicted flood plain width, IBI, and aquatic life use attainment status	
<i>Robinson Run (05060001 190 060)</i>	4-24
Table 4.1.6.1 Allocations of phosphorus, sediment, and fecal coliform	
Table 4.1.6.2 Point source allocations	
Table 4.1.6.3 Total phosphorus relative source contributions	
Figure 4.1.6 Longitudinal distribution of recommended versus predicted flood plain width, IBI, and aquatic life use attainment status	
<i>Sugar Run (05060001 190 070)</i>	4-27
Table 4.1.7.1 Allocations of phosphorus and sediment	
Table 4.1.7.2 Total phosphorus relative source contributions	
Table 4.1.8.1 Average potassium levels in the Big Darby Creek mainstem . . .	4-30
Table 4.1.8.2 Dissolved oxygen concentrations in Flat Branch and Big Darby Creek	4-31
Table 4.1.8 Comparisons of the statistical significance of water chemistry by subwatershed in the upper Big Darby Creek	4-32

Middle Big Darby Creek (05060001 200)

Figure 4.2 Plain City WWTP discharge to Big Darby Creek (photo) 4-35
Table 4.2.1 Bedload and habitat TMDLs 4-36
Table 4.2.2 Recommended floodplain widths 4-37

Upper Middle Big Darby Creek (05060001 200 010) 4-38

Table 4.2.1.1 Allocations of phosphorus
Table 4.2.1.2 Point source allocations
Table 4.2.1.3 Total phosphorus relative source contributions

Lower Middle Big Darby Creek (05060001 200 020) 4-40

Table 4.2.2.1 Allocations of phosphorus
Table 4.2.2.2 Point source allocations
Table 4.2.2.3 Total phosphorus relative source contributions

Little Darby Creek (05060001 210)

Table 4.3.1 Bedload and habitat TMDLs 4-45
Table 4.3.2 Recommended Flood Plain Widths 4-49

Upper Little Darby Creek (05060001 210 010) 4-50

Table 4.3.1.1 Allocations of phosphorus and sediment
Table 4.3.1.2 Point source allocations
Table 4.3.1.3 Total phosphorus relative source contributions

Upper Treacle Creek (05060001 210 020) 4-52

Table 4.3.2.1 Allocations of phosphorus and sediment
Table 4.3.2.3 Total phosphorus relative source contributions

Proctor Run (05060001 210 030) 4-53

Table 4.3.3.1 Allocations of phosphorus, sediment, and fecal coliform
Table 4.3.3.2 Point source allocations
Table 4.3.3.3 Total phosphorus relative source contributions

Lower Treacle Creek (05060001 210 040) 4-55

Table 4.3.4.1 Allocations of phosphorus, sediment, and fecal coliform
Table 4.3.4.3 Total phosphorus relative source contributions

Middle Little Darby Creek (05060001 210 050) 4-56

Table 4.3.5.1 Allocations of phosphorus, sediment, and fecal coliform
Table 4.3.5.2 Point source allocations
Table 4.3.5.3 Total phosphorus relative source contributions

Spring Fork (05060001 210 060) 4-57
Table 4.3.6.1 Allocations of phosphorus, sediment, and fecal coliform
Table 4.3.6.2 Point source allocations
Table 4.3.6.3 Total phosphorus relative source contributions

Lower Little Darby Creek (05060001 210 070) 4-60
Table 4.3.7.1 Allocations of phosphorus, sediment, and fecal coliform
Table 4.3.7.2 Point source allocations
Table 4.3.7.3 Total phosphorus relative source contributions
Figure 4.3.7 TSS and total phosphorus load duration curves

Lower Big Darby Creek (05060001 220)

Table 4.4.1 Bedload and habitat TMDLs 4-64
Table 4.4.2 Comparison of needed and predicted active floodplain for selected
segments 4-68
Table 4.4.3 Recommended Flood Plain Widths 4-69

Hellbranch Run (05060001 220 010) 4-71
Table 4.4.1.1 Allocations of phosphorus, sediment, and fecal coliform
Table 4.4.1.2 Nonpoint source allocations for total phosphorus
Table 4.4.1.3 Total phosphorus relative source contributions
Table 4.4.1.4 Flow based allocations
Table 4.4.1.5 Municipal Separate Storm Sewer System allocations
Table 4.4.1.6 Point source allocations
Figure 4.4.1.1 Fecal coliform load duration curve
Figure 4.4.1.2 TSS and total phosphorus load duration curves
Figure 4.4.1.3 Longitudinal distribution of recommended versus predicted
flood plain width, IBI, and aquatic life use attainment status
Figure 4.4.1.4 Longitudinal distribution of recommended versus predicted
flood plain width, IBI, and aquatic life use attainment status

Upper Lower Big Darby Creek (05060001 220 020) 4-76
Table 4.4.2.1 Allocations of phosphorus
Table 4.4.2.2 Point source allocations
Table 4.4.2.3 Total phosphorus relative source contributions

Middle Lower Big Darby Creek (05060001 220 030) 4-77
Table 4.4.3.1 Allocations of phosphorus and sediment
Table 4.4.3.2 Point source allocations
Table 4.4.3.3 Total phosphorus relative source contributions
Figure 4.4.3 TSS and total phosphorus load duration curves

Figure 4.5.1 Big Darby Creek active floodplain 4-81
Figure 4.5.2 100-year floodplain of the Big Darby Creek 4-82
Figure 4.5.3 Frequently flooded soils in the Big Darby Creek watershed 4-83

Implementation of the Big Darby Creek TMDL

Figure 5.1 Examples of low gradient, county maintained streams in the middle Big Darby Creek sub-watershed, and the buffer conditions at their outlets 5-5

Table 5.2.5 Reference to effluent limitations for municipal NPDES permits 5-17

Acknowledgments

The following Ohio EPA staff provided technical services for this project:

- Project leader - Mike Gallaway
- Water quality modeling and TMDL development - Erin Sherer
- GIS Support - Matt Fancher, Dale White and Ben Webb (DCWC)
- Public involvement - Mike Gallaway, Dan Dudley, Steve Malone, Tom Harcarik, Erin Sherer, Carol Hester
- Geomorphological analysis - Dale White (analyst) and Dan Mecklenburg (ODNR)
- Chemical sampling - Modeling staff, Jeff Bohne, Mike Gallaway
- Biological assistance - Marc Smith, Ed Moore
- Legal assistance - Bryan Zima

Many full- and part-time staff participated in field monitoring.

Acknowledgment is made to Darby Creek Watershed Coordinator, Ben Webb, and the Darby Creek Joint Board of Supervisors for their continuing involvement in this process.

Acknowledgment is made of the property owners who allowed Ohio EPA personnel access to the study area.